

## **FACTS**

### **INFORMATION FROM LAW ENFORCEMENT**

On Saturday, July 11, at approximately 7:35 p.m., law enforcement arrived at the residence of Bob and Judy Dean in reference to a domestic disturbance. Bob was standing outside on the front porch and approached the officers as they stepped out of the vehicle. He apologized for the inconvenience, stating that his young daughter, Brittany, had overreacted to an argument he and his wife were having and dialed 911. He appeared calm, was polite and invited the officers into the residence to conduct their investigation. A slight odor of alcohol was detected on his breath. Bob is a white male, age 33.

Once inside the officers met Brian, Bob's 10-year-old step son. Brian appeared well-bonded with Bob and volunteered that his little sister was often over-dramatic and blew things out of proportion. He insisted nothing happened that evening between his mom and dad. When asked if they ever argued, he replied they did not. Brian appeared small for his age.

Officers asked to speak with four-year-old Brittany who was in her room wrapped around the family dog, Buster. Brittany had been crying and appeared timid and frightened. When asked questions about any possible disturbance or the 911 call she made, she insistently repeated, "I don't know." Despite continued efforts by law enforcement to build a rapport with Brittany, she remained withdrawn. Buster cowered behind Brittany.

The alleged victim, Judy, was on the back porch smoking a cigarette. Although she was not crying when law enforcement arrived, her make-up was smudged and her face was red

suggesting that she had been crying recently. When asked about a domestic disturbance, Judy admitted that she and Bob had gotten into a heated argument, but said that Bob never laid a hand on her. Judy said Bob had never hit her; he was not that kind of man. She insisted her daughter, Brittany, got scared when they were screaming at each other and called 911.

Judy was wearing a pair of low-rise sweat pants and a sports bra covered by an unbuttoned, man's long-sleeved plaid shirt. Her hair appeared uncombed and pulled back with a hair tie. After noticing what appeared to be three parallel scratches above her right breast, a female officer asked Judy to move into the kitchen where the lighting was better and insisted she remove the plaid shirt. She reluctantly did after she was assured that Bob was outside in the front yard speaking with other officers. Observed were three linear parallel scratches on her right breast approximately 3 inches in length. Other injuries were also noted: a large, hand-sized contusion on the left upper arm just above the elbow; a bruise suspected to be a bite mark which broke the skin on the right side of the back just below the sports bra; a silver-dollar-sized bruise on the outside of the right forearm; scratches and contusions to the left side of the neck, left shoulder and left shoulder blade; and a small bruise on the outside right upper arm just above the elbow. All injuries appeared fresh. Photos were taken with a digital camera by the officer and are attached to this report.. The trash can in the kitchen was filled with Busch beer cans. Judy did not smell of alcohol.

Judy became very tense during the photographing and volunteered that these injuries were due to her clumsiness. Judy said she bruises easily and is constantly bumping into things at work. She blamed Buster, the family's red-nosed pit bull, for the scratch marks on her breast. She also insisted the wound on her back that resembled a bite mark was a hickey that her husband had given her the night before. Judy is a white female, age 27.

While Judy was being interviewed by an officer in the house, another officer was interviewing Bob on the front porch. Bob revealed that he and Judy had been married for almost 5 years, but had been together for 8 years. He said they had their share of arguments, mostly about money, but that he would never lay a hand on her. He didn't believe it was right to hit a woman. Bob said he lost his sales job about six months ago as a result of the economy, and had been

unable to find work. As a result, Judy went to work in the custodial department at Shands Hospital. Bob said Judy's work often involved odd-hour shifts that made family life difficult. Bob's prior criminal history showed a dropped Disorderly Intoxication from 2014 and a DUI conviction in 2016. Bob was the respondent in a Temporary Injunction for the Protection Against Domestic Violence in 2008. Petitioner was a live-in girlfriend named Tiffany Carr. She did not appear at the final hearing and the injunction was dismissed.

Due to the inconsistencies in Judy's explanation of her injuries and the 911 call made by Brittany, law enforcement found probable cause and arrested Bob for domestic battery. Bob remained calm during the arrest. Judy became hysterical and begged law enforcement not to take him. Due to her emotional state, a victim advocate was called to the scene. A hotline call to the Department of Children and Family Services (DCF) was also made because it appeared from the 911 call that at least one child had been present during the alleged domestic battery.

## **INFORMATION FROM DCF**

A Protective Investigator (PI) arrived at the Dean home at 9:30 a.m. on Sunday, July 12. Present at the residence was Anna Hadley, Bob Dean's mother, and the two children, Brian and Brittany. Ms Hadley said that Judy Dean was at the courthouse for Bob's First Appearance. The children were watching cartoons on the television. Ms. Hadley was reluctant to allow the PI to talk to the children, stating that the system was out to get her son. She begrudgingly agreed when the PI explained the requirements of Florida Statutes. The PI spoke to Brian in his bedroom, which was exceptionally neat for a 10-year-old. Brian appeared nervous, wringing his hands and speaking at a rapid pace. He also appeared small for his age. Brian said that Bob was not his "real" dad but had been with his mom for as long as he could remember. Brian said Bob is Brittany's "real" dad. Brian said he didn't really like school and didn't like many of the other kids because they had bad attitudes. When questioned further about what a bad attitude was, he responded that the other kids didn't take many things seriously. Brian stated that the only time he can remember Bob getting mad at his mother is when he did something wrong and

his mother tried to stick up for him. Brian said his mother works a lot and his dad stays home, mostly watching TV. Brian became hesitant when the PI asked about his dad drinking beer. When questioned about extended family, Brian said that “mom-mom”, Bob’s mother, spent a lot of time with them and many times would let them “break the rules”, such as staying up past their bedtimes, eating snacks, etc. Brian said that this made mom mad. Brian volunteered that it was important for him at his age to protect the family. When asked what that meant, Brian could only respond that families need to stick together.

The PI spoke to Brittany outside in the backyard where she was playing with the family dog, Buster. Brittany was average size and appeared to be developmentally on target. Brittany was carefree in her play with Buster, laughing and chasing the dog and his ball. The PI began by asking questions about her daycare and her teachers. Brittany could name all of the employees at the daycare and many of the children. She said she liked story time, painting and the class hamster, Pete. Brittany said her mother picked her up and dropped her off most of the time, but lately her mom-mom had been doing that, too. The PI reviewed good touch/bad touch with Brittany. She understood the concepts and was able to give examples from daycare of hitting and biting. When asked about good touch/bad touch at home she immediately responded her dad gave her mom bad touches. When the PI followed up on this comment, Brittany became withdrawn and began to look toward the back porch. When asked if her dad ever hurt her mom, she shook her head “yes.” When asked if she was ever afraid at home, she again shook her head “yes.” When asked if there was anything else she wanted to tell the PI, Brittany stated, “Daddy hurts Buster and Brian, too.” She would not be any more specific.

The PI spoke to Anna Hadley, Bob Dean’s mother and the woman the children called “mom-mom.” Anna stated that she lived close by and spent much time in the Dean home, especially since Judy started back to work. She said she tried to help with child transportation and the cooking so her son and the kids would have good home-cooked meals. She stated that Judy wasn’t much of a cook or a housekeeper. Anna said that she loved both children equally, even though Brian was not the biological son of Bob. She said Bob did his best to make sure Brian was raised to be a respectable young man. She added that if that were left up to Judy, Brian

would be lazy and disrespectful. Anna said that her son would never lay a hand on a woman, especially in light of the fact that he had seen his father beat her for years before his untimely death at age 40.

The PI spoke to Judy Dean by phone later that afternoon. Judy explained that she had been at First Appearances that morning. When asked what happened, she said the Judge released Bob, but told him he could not come back to the house or have any contact with her until further order of the court. Judy was upset by the judge's ruling. She said this would be a hardship for Bob. When asked about the incident, Judy was apologetic that she and Bob had argued in front of the children. She said Bob was going through a very bad time since he lost his job and that her work schedule only complicated matters. When asked what the fight the evening before was about, Judy said Bob was angry because she wanted to go out for a short run. She said things escalated quickly and soon they were arguing about money and the kids and her inability to care for them. She said the argument ended up in the kitchen as she tried to leave through the back door. She guessed her arm got caught in the door and caused the bruising seen by law enforcement. When asked if Bob touched her at any time, she said no, but as he was trying to keep her from leaving, she pushed him. Judy said she should have been the one arrested.

Judy said that she and Bob met on the Internet when Brian was just a toddler. Judy was in Ohio; Bob was in Florida. Brian's father abandoned her when she was pregnant with Brian. Judy said that she and Bob corresponded by email for several months and she was impressed with his intelligence and traditional family values. He sent her money to come to Florida to visit and she never went back to Ohio. She said he helped parent Brian and called him his son from the start of their relationship. Since Bob was making good money, Judy said she did not have to work and stayed home with Brian full time. Several years later, Judy became pregnant with Brittany and she and Bob married. Judy said her pregnancy with Brittany was difficult and she was sick much of the time. Judy said that Bob started coming home during the day to check on her and bought her a cell phone so he could reach her at all times. She said Bob still worries about her and the kids and frequently calls for updates.

Judy said that Bob has always taken responsibility for the family finances. She said she was content with that arrangement because she was bad with money. She said Bob gives her \$20 per week for spending money. Everything else, such as gas, groceries, incidentals, gets paid with their joint charge card. Judy said since Bob lost his job, they have had to really tighten their budget. She said he even gives her a mileage budget each week and checks the odometer on the car every time she leaves and arrives home from errands. Bob now drives her to and from work to make sure she doesn't add any extra miles that they can't afford.

When the PI confronted Judy about Brittany's statements regarding domestic violence in the home, Judy became quiet on the telephone and then explained that Brittany often makes things up. She then added Brittany doesn't understand how families work. When asked to elaborate on that statement, Judy could not. When the PI told Judy that, based on the DCF investigation, it would be recommended that Brittany and Brian be interviewed at the Child Advocacy Center by a trained forensic interviewer, Judy became extremely upset. She told the PI she couldn't possibly agree to that without input from Bob and she wasn't supposed to talk with him. The PI recommended that Judy consider getting an Injunction for the Protection Against Domestic Violence.

The PI contacted Bob Dean at his mother's residence. Bob refused to talk with the PI, stating that he was contacting his lawyer and was going to make sure that nobody from his family, especially his children, spoke to anyone associated with DCF.

## **Information from Mya Bounds, co-worker of Judy Dean**

Mya Bounds spoke to the State Attorney's Office investigator on Friday, July 24 at Shands. Mya expressed concerns for Judy's safety if the information she divulged ever became public. Mya said that Judy often came to work with bruises. Mya said she began to notice these injuries when they changed into their work garments in the employees' dressing room at

Shands. Mya said at first Judy tried to hide the marks or make excuses for them. Then one day Mya confronted Judy and she broke down and began sobbing. Mya said that day by day, more stories of Bob's abuse were told by Judy, including beatings, chokings, and rapes. Mya said these stories were almost more than she could bear to hear. Mya said Judy would rationalize how Bob's actions were her fault, and how she somehow deserved this treatment. Judy had recently complained that Bob's drinking was making him more short tempered and mean. Judy described life at home like walking on egg shells. Mya said Judy was concerned that the Brian and Brittany were aware of the abuse, although she tried very hard to hide it from them. Judy had been keeping Brittany at daycare for longer hours in an effort to reduce her exposure to Bob, but their recent financial situation had made that impossible. Judy was also concerned that Bob was turning Brian against her. Bob would make Brian yell terrible things at her. Judy told Mya that she knew this hurt Brian's heart, but that he, too, was scared of Bob. Judy told Mya that if Bob ever found out that she told anyone about the abuse, he would kill her. She said he always told her that the kids would be better off without her. He also told her that her body would never be found.

Mya called the SAO investigator back three days later and said she watched Bob drop Judy off at work the evening before. The "no contact" order from the criminal arrest was still in place.