







# REPRESENTING JUSTICE Invention, Controversy, and Rights in City-States and

**Democratic Courtrooms** 

Judith Resnik and Dennis Curtis

## SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS IX PREFACE XV

CHAPTER I	A Remnant of the Renaissance: The Transnational Iconography of Justice 1
CHAPTER 2	Civic Space, the Public Square, and Good Governance 18
CHAPTER <b>3</b>	Obedience: The Judge as the Loyal Servant of the State 38
CHAPTER 4	Of Eyes and Ostriches 62
CHAPTER 5	Why Eyes? Color, Blindness, and Impartiality 91
CHAPTER 6	Representations and Abstractions: Identity, Politics, and Rights 106
CHAPTER 7	From Seventeenth-Century Town Halls to Twentieth-Century Courts 134
CHAPTER 8	A Building and Litigation Boom in Twentieth-Century Federal Courts 154
CHAPTER 9 Monument	Late Twentieth-Century United States Courts: ality, Security, and Eclectic Imagery 169
CHAPTER 10 (and Prison	Monuments to the Present and Museums of the Past: National Courts (s) 193
CHAPTER II	Constructing Regional Rights 225
CHAPTER I2	Multi-Jurisdictional Premises: From Peace to Crimes 247
CHAPTER <b>13</b>	From "Rites" to "Rights" 288
CHAPTER I4	Courts: In and Out of Sight, Site, and Cite 306
CHAPTER I5	An Iconography for Democratic Adjudication 338
ENDNOTES 379 NOTE ON SOURCES 603 SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY 607 INDEX OF IMAGES 629 SUBJECT INDEX 633	

### CONTENTS

PREFACE XV

#### CHAPTER 1 A Remnant of the Renaissance: The Transnational Iconography of Justice 1

A Pictorial Puzzle 1 A Virtuous Visual Competition 8

The Cardinal and Theological Virtues in a *Psychomachia* 8 The Cohort 9 Justice's Ascent 12

JUSTICE'S VIOLENCE 12 VISUALIZING JUSTICE'S PAIN AND CHALLENGES 13 Adjudication's Transformation: Access for All before Independent Judges in Open Courts 14

Celebrating and Understanding New Demands 15 Building Idioms: Transparency, Access, Identity, and Security 15

DEMOCRACY'S CHALLENGES 16

Privatizing Process and Controlling Access 16 The Decline of Adjudication 16

**Re-Presenting Justice** 17

## CHAPTER 2 Civic Space, the Public Square, and Good Governance 18

A Long Political Pedigree: Shamash, Maat, Dikê, and Themis 18

The Scales of Babylonia and of the Zodiac 18 The Balance in Egyptian *Books of the Dead* 20 Embodied Greek and Roman Goddesses 21

Justicia, St. Michael, and the Cardinal Virtue Justice 22

CIVIC SPACES, ALLEGORIES OF GOOD AND BAD GOVERNMENT, AND FOURTEENTH-CENTURY SIENA 25

Public Buildings Fashioning Civic Identities 25

Lorenzetti and the Palazzo Pubblico 26 "Love justice, you who judge the earth" 28 Justice Bound by Tyranny 29 Theories of Governance: Aristotle, Cicero, Aquinas, Latini, God, and Political Propaganda 29 Good Government on the East and West Coasts of the United States: Reiterations by Caleb Ives Bach and Dorothea Rockburne 30

Last Judgments in Town Halls 33

Civic, Public, and Christian 33 "For that judgment you judge, shall redound on you": The Magdeburg Mandate 34 Conflating the Last Judgment with Trials 34

# CHAPTER 3 Obedience: The Judge as the Loyal Servant of the State 38

Flayed Alive or Maimed: Judicial Obligations Inscribed on Town Hall Walls in Bruges and Geneva 38

Controlling Judges: A Fifteenth-Century Cambyses in the Town Hall of Bruges 38 Bribes, Gifts, and Budgets 39 Skeptical about Law and Distrustful of Judges 42 The Unjust Prince: Plutarch's Theban Judges and Alciatus's Emblems 43 Dogs, Snakes, and Virgins: Even-handedness in Ripa's *Iconologia* 43 Hands Cut: Disfigured Judges and Regal Justices for Sixteenth-Century Geneva 44 Judicial Subservience and Dependence 47 THE CHALLENGE AND PAIN OF RENDERING

JUDGMENT: AMSTERDAM'S SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY TOWN HALL 48

An "undertaking of megalomanic proportions" 48 The Virtues of Prosperity: Justice, Peace, and Prudence Reigning over an Expanding Municipality 49 "The free state flourishes, when the people honor the laws" 51 Harming Your Children in the Name of the Law: Solomon, Zaleucus, Brutus, and Death 55 The Judgment of Solomon 56 The Blinding of Zaleucus and His Son and the Execution of Brutus's Children 57 "SO SHALL YOU BE JUDGED" 61

#### CHAPTER 4 Of Eyes and Ostriches 62

BLIND TO THE LIGHT AND BLINDFOLDED BY THE FOOL 62 The Blindfolded Justice in the Amsterdam Tribunal 62 "Open the eyes that are blind" 64 Synagoga: Blind to the "Light" of Christianity 65 Justice and Judges as Fools 67 Alciatus's Theban Judges and Ripa's Injunctions: "A Steely Gaze," the Eye of God, and Bandaged Eyes 69 Bruegel's Justice (or Injustice?) 70 Damhoudere's Janus-Faced Justice 72 Turning a Critical Eye 74 TRANSCENDENT, WIDE-EYED, AND AMIDST THE ANIMALS 75 Raphael's Glory of Justice 75 Symbolism's Caprice: The Many Animals of Justice 76 The Proud and the Dead Bird: Giulio Romano's Justice with an Ostrich in the Vatican and Luca Giordano's Justice Disarmed 76 Sheep and Foxes, Dogs and Serpents: Rubens's Wide-Eyed Justice 79 THE PAST AS PROLOGUE: SIGHTED OR BLINDFOLDED, AND TALL 79 Venice as Justice, Justice as Venice 79 Across the English Channel 83 Queen Anne as Justice 83 The Lord Mayor's Show 84 Dublin's Justice 85 Old Bailey's Open-Eyed and Wide-Armed Justice 87 Across the Atlantic Ocean: Kansas's Sharp-Eved Prairie Falcon and Vancouver's Peaceable Justice 87 A Resilient, Albeit Invented, Tradition 89

#### CHAPTER 5 Why Eyes? Color, Blindness, and Impartiality 91

ICONOGRAPHICAL CONVENTIONS, PICTORIAL PUZZLES, AND JUSTICE'S BLINDFOLD 91

Commitments to Representation 91

Impossible to Depict: An Exchange between Mantegna and Momus 93 Creating the Canonical Elements 94

Sight, Knowledge, and Impartiality 95

"Suppose a Man born blind . . . be made to see": Locke, Diderot, and Molyneux's Problem 97 Rawlsian Veiling 98 Ambiguity and Self-Help: Joshua Reynolds's

*Justice* in Oxford and Diana Moore's *Justice* in New Hampshire 98

Constitutional Metaphors and Injustices 102

Color-Blind 102

Impartial or Unjust? The "Festering Sores" behind the Blindfold in Langston Hughes's *Justice* 103 Confrontation, Eyewitnesses, Prison Garb,

Spectators' Badges, and Ostrich Imagery 104

## CHAPTER 6 Representations and Abstractions: Identity, Politics, and Rights 106

JURIDICAL RIGHTS AND ICONOGRAPHY 106

Public Art and Popular Dismay 106 Batcolumns and Mariannes 107

Breaching the Conventions of Justice when Decorating the Public Sphere 108

Unblindfolded: A "Communist" Justice Raises a "Newark Row" 108 Hiding a "Mulatto Justice" in Aiken, South Carolina 110 Life in Mississippi, Draped 113 An "Indian" Hung in Boise 116 Muhammad in Midtown and at the United States Supreme Court 117 Lady of Justice but No Moco Jumbie in the Virgin Islands 121 The Safety of Abstraction: Ellsworth Kelly in Boston 124 JUDGING JUDGES: FROM SPECTATOR TO CRITICAL OBSERVER 126 The Appearance of Impartiality 127 Duck Blinds in 2004 128

Restructuring Law's Possibilities 130 Systemic Unfairness in Individualized Justice 131 Structural Interventions: Judicial Task Forces on Bias in the Courts 132 GLIMPSING THE GAPS 133

#### CHAPTER 7 From Seventeenth-Century Town Halls to Twentieth-Century Courts 134

PUBLIC AND SOCIAL TRADITIONS IN TOWN AND COUNTRY COURTS 134 Building a New Legal System in the United STATES 136 A Grounding in Colonial and State Court Systems 136 Purpose-Built Structures: From Houses and Taverns to Courts 136 Segregating Interiors by Roles and Race 136 Architecture and Adornment 137 Juridical Privilege, Exclusion, and Protest 137 Marking a "Federal Presence" 139 Borrowing Space, Rules, and Administrative Support 140 Custom Houses, Marine Hospitals, and Post Offices 140 Professional Architects and Public Patronage 142 Courts-From California to the New York Island 142 Statehood for Texas and a New Federal Building in Galveston 143 Building and Rebuilding in Des Moines and Biloxi 144 Moving Further, Farther, and Higher 145 Westward Expansion: Denver, Missoula, and San Diego 145 Offshore and Across Land: Puerto Rico and Alaska 147 Sky High in New York City 149

ARCHITECTURAL STATEMENTS AND OBSOLESCENCE 152

#### CHAPTER 8 A Building and Litigation Boom in Twentieth-Century Federal Courts 154

INSTITUTIONAL GIRTH: IN-HOUSE ADMINISTRATION, Research, and a Corporate Voice 154

William Howard Taft's Innovations 154 Building the Administrative Apparatus 155 "Court Quarters" 156 PUTTING CASES INTO COURTS: THE SECOND RECONSTRUCTION 157
Rights across the Board 157
From a Three-Story Courthouse in Grand Forks to Twenty-Eight Floors in St. Louis and 760,000
Square Feet in Boston 158
Housing the Corporate Judiciary 161
REDESIGNING FEDERAL BUILDINGS 163
The Peripheral Role of "Fine Art" 163

John F. Kennedy, Daniel Patrick Moynihan, and Government Space: The 1960s Guiding Principles 164

Inelegant Design: The National Endowment for the Arts as Architectural Critic 165 Subsequent Precepts: Preservation, Conservation,

Accessibility, Sociability, and Security 166 GSA's Design Excellence Program 168

#### CHAPTER 9 Late Twentieth-Century United States Courts: Monumentality, Security, and Eclectic Imagery 169

RENOVATION, RENT, AND WILLIAM REHNQUIST 169 "Judicial Space Emergencies" 169

Court Design Guides 171

Rescaling the Proportions 171 Routing Circulation to Avoid Contact 173 Dedicated Courtrooms 174

Negotiating Rent and Space 174

Cutting into the Judicial Dollar 176 Inter-Agency, Inter-Branch Oversight or Intrusion 178 "Rent Relief" 178 A Courtroom of One's Own 180

Judicial Political Acumen and Incongruity: The Rehnquist Judiciary's Monuments to Federal Adjudication 181

"ART-IN-ARCHITECTURE" 182

Selecting Community-Friendly Art to "stand the test of time" 183

Collaborative Diversity 183

Quietly Quizzical: Tom Otterness in Portland, Oregon and Jenny Holzer in Sacramento, California 184

"Plop art" and Building Norms 191

#### CHAPTER 10 Monuments to the Present and Museums of the Past: National Courts (and Prisons) 193

COMPARATIVE CURRENTS 193

Singularly Impressive, Diverse, and Homogeneous 193 The Business of Building Courts: The Academy of Architecture for Justice 194

JUSTICE PALACES FOR FRANCE 195

Legible Architecture for an Evolving Justice 195 "Le 1% décoratif" 200 Jean Nouvel and Jenny Holzer in Nantes 204

CREATING NEW SYMBOLS OF NATIONHOOD: A Supreme Court Building for Israel 208

"Circles of Justice" and Laws That Are "Straight" 209 Roman Cardos, British Courtyards, Moorish Arches, and Jerusalem Stone 210 Judgment at the Gate 213 "The Symbols" 213 Reiterating Familiar Motifs 215

New and Recycled from Melbourne to Helsinki 216

"Australian in concept and materials": Melbourne's Commonwealth Law Courts 216 From a Liquor Factory to a District Court in Helsinki 220

"JUSTICE FACILITIES": JAILS, PRISONS, AND COURTS 222

#### CHAPTER 11 Constructing Regional Rights 225

JUDGING ACROSS BORDERS 225 "MIXED COURTS," THE SLAVE TRADE, AND SPECIAL VENUES FOR FOREIGNERS 225 NATION-STATES ALLIED THROUGH COURTS 227 Luxembourg and the European Court of Justice 227 Enduring (and Expanding) Authority: Le Palais Plus 228 Dominique Perrault's Golden "morphological development" 229 "Under the watchful eye of paintings and sculptures" 233 Strasbourg and the European Court of Human

Rights 235
Le Palais des Droits de L'Homme 235
Building-in Expansion (for Space and Rights) 237
Richard Rogers's "monumental cylinders" 237
"Easier to see your neighbor's human rights violations than your own" 238

The ECtHR and the ECJ: The Form of Resources 239 Regional Law: The Organization of American States and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 239 The 1907 Central American Court of Justice: A "permanent court of justice" 240 Shaping a Pan-American Convention on Human Rights 242 Parallels and Distinctions: Human Rights Adjudication in Europe and the Americas 243 Costa Rica and the Inter-American Court: Linked "not only by conviction, but by action" 246 Engineering a \$600,000 Renovation 246

#### CHAPTER 12 Multi-Jurisdictional Premises: From Peace to Crimes 247

MODELING THE FUTURE: EPIC ARCHITECTURE AND LONELY BUILDINGS 247 THE PEACE PALACE AND THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE 248 Convening for Peace 249 The Amsterdam Town Hall Redux: "Dutch High-Renaissance Architecture" for the World's Library and Court 249 Competing and Litigating for Building Commissions 249 National Artifacts for the World Court 253 Tribunals to Which No Country Can Be "Bidden" 255 The Misnomer of the Permanent Court of Arbitration and the Puzzles of International Adjudication 255 The Small Hall of Justice and the PCA 256 The League of Nations' Permanent Court of International Justice 257 Nationality and Judicial Selection 257 Inaugurating the "World Court" and the Hague Academy for International Law 259 Lawmaking through Advisory Opinions and Contentious Cases 259 The Great Hall of Justice and the United Nations' International Court of Justice 261 Nationality's Continuing Import 261 A Celebratory Iconography 262 Renovations, Modernization, and Expansion: Carnegie's Library at Last 263 A Home for Living Law or a Museum? 264

TRANSNATIONAL COURTS WITH SPECIALIZED JURISDICTIONS 265 An International Tribunal for the Sea, Seated in Hamburg 265 A "Constitution for the Oceans" 267 Alternatives for International Disputes about the Sea 268 Form before Function 269 International Human Atrocities 272 The International Tribunals for the Former Yugoslavia, Rwanda, and Sierra Leone 272 Designing for a Future of Crimes: The International Criminal Court 275 Operationalizing a Criminal Court System 277 Occupying Permanent Quarters Rather Than Riding Circuit 279 "One site forever": A Timeless Image and Four Security Zones 280

The Logos of Justice: Budgets, Caseloads, Scales, and Buildings 281

#### CHAPTER 13 From "Rites" to "Rights" 288

The Triumph of Courts 288 The Democracy in Adjudication 289

"Hear the Other Side" 289
"Judges as free, impartial, and independent as the lot of humanity will admit" 292
"That justice may not be done in a corner nor in any covert manner" 293
Reflexivity: Transnational Signatures of Justice 294

Theorizing Openness: From Unruly Crowds to Bentham's "Publicity" 295

Observing and Cabining Authority: The Dissemination of Knowledge through Codification and Publicity 296 The Architecture of Discipline: From "Judge & Co." to the Panopticon 297

Forming Public Opinion through Complementary Institutions: An Uncensored Press and a Subsidized Postal System 299 Developing Public Sphere(s) 299 Adjudication as a Democratic Practice 301

The Power of Participatory Observers to Divest Authority from Judges and Litigants 301 Public Relations in Courts 302 Dignifying Litigants: Information-Forcing through Participatory Parity 303 The Press, the Post, and Courts: Venerable Eighteenth-Century Institutions Vulnerable in the Twenty-First 304

## CHAPTER 14 Courts: In and Out of Sight, Site, and Cite 306

Adjudication's Challenges to Democracy 306

Demand and Distress 307 The Data on Privatization: The Vanishing Trial 310 The Methods of Privatization 311

Managerial Judges Settling Cases 311 Unheard Arguments and "Unpublished" Opinions 313 Devolution: Administrative Agencies as Courts 314

Outsourcing through Mandatory Private Arbitration 318

REGULATORY OPTIONS: PUBLIC ACCESS TO ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION 321 MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL PREMISES (AGAIN) 322

Tracking, Managing, and Obliging Mediation: Lord Woolf's Reforms in England and Wales 322 Outsourcing to Tribunals 324 Competing for Transnational Arbitration 324 Mediation under the Direction of the European Union 325

TRANSNATIONAL PROCEDURAL SHIFTS 326 The Continuum on Which Guantánamo Bay Sits 327

The Appointing Authority's Adjudicatory Discretion 327 Court-Like, Court-Lite: "Honor Bound to

Defend Freedom" 328

Foucault's Footsteps 334

# CHAPTER 15 An Iconography for Democratic Adjudication 338

TRANSITIONAL AND TRANSNATIONAL IDIOMS 338 Symbolic Courts with Facades of Glass 340

Opaque Transparency 341 The Politics of Glass 341 Zones of Authority 342

REPLENISHING THE VISUAL VOCABULARY 344

An Interdependent Collective: The Cardinal Four of Justice, Prudence, Temperance, and Fortitude 344

The Burdens of Judging: The Nails of a *Nkisi* Figure 348 FACING JUSTICE'S INJUSTICE 349 Nelson Mandela's Jail as South Africa's Constitutional Court 350 Aiming to Capture the Humanity of Social Interdependence 350 Prison Vistas of Barbed Wire 352 Splashes of Color and References to Oppression 355 The Challenge of Crime and Caseloads 355 Visually Recording (in)Justice in Mexico's Supreme Court 356 Mexican Muralists, Orozco, and "Profoundly National" Paintings 356 George Biddle's Redemption from the Horrors of War 361 Cauduro's Vision: Torture, Homicide, and Other Crimes, Unpunished 362 Impunity and Insecurity 365 Open Tents, Tattered Coats, and the Challenges Entailed in Democratic Promises OF JUSTICE 366

"If performed in the *open air*": The Federal Court of Australia's Ruling on the Ngaanyatjarra Land Claims 367

Terra nullius and the Native Title Act 367 Commemorating Power, Witnessing Compromise 369 An Icon of Free Legal Services in Minnesota 372 More Courthouses than Counties 372 A Jacket, Worn 373 FACETS OF JUDGMENT 374 ENDNOTES 379 NOTE ON SOURCES 603 SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY 607 Books, Monographs, Articles, and Dissertations 607 Caselaw 626 International Conventions and Treaties 627 INDEX OF IMAGES 629 Painters, Printmakers, and Engravers 629 Sculptors 629 Photographers 630 Cartoonists 631 Buildings 631

Logos and Seals 632 Brochures and Other Objects 632 Graphs and Charts 632 SUBJECT INDEX 633

Color plates follow page 142.



- "This book is a richly documented study of the iconography of Justice, from Antiquity through its medieval personification as a Cardinal Virtue to the emergence of her figure as an independent icon of a social value. Tracing the continuing resonance of that figure to the modern courtroom and in the public imagination, *Representing Justice* demonstrates the power of an image to embody ideals and, when those ideals are ignored, to stand as an indictment of injustice."—DAVID ROSAND, Meyer Schapiro Professor of Art History Emeritus, Columbia University
- "The scope of the book is breathtaking. Through the iconography of justice, Resnik and Curtis chart the history of courts and public justice and compellingly make the case for the central role of adjudication to democracy. The combination of haunting and often visceral imagery with powerful analysis makes the book both a joy to read and an inspiration."—**PROFESSOR DAME HAZEL GENN,** Dean of the Faculty of Laws, University College London (UCL)
- "Representing Justice is a fascinating and ambitious study of the iconography of justice and what it reveals about attitudes towards a just society, impartiality, and authority, from the Renaissance to the Mexican Muralists. In this engaging and eminently readable book, the authors show how emblems, icons, and courthouses vividly embody the fundamentally democratic process of adjudication."—**RUTH WEISBERG**, Roski School of Fine Arts, University of Southern California
- "In this visually stunning and provocative book, Judith Resnik and Dennis Curtis lead us to think in new ways about justice as symbol, justice as reality, and the connections as well as the distance between the two."—LINDA GREENHOUSE, Joseph Goldstein Lecturer in Law, Yale Law School

"How did a blindfolded lady holding scales became the ubiquitous image of justice? How have designs and decorations of spaces defined and redefined adjudication? Assembling monumental research, Resnik and Curtis powerfully show how images and buildings reflect and shape local and international justice across human history and how privatized dispute resolution, security concerns, and diminishing community participation erode the ideal and reality of courts' justice."—MARTHA MINOW, Dean and Jeremiah Smith, Jr. Professor, Harvard Law School

- "This is a profoundly original and rich book. By looking at the public iconography of justice, the book maps the evolution of courts and their relationship with public power and democracy as it has never been done. In this instance, an image is indeed worth a thousand words. Judith Resnik and Dennis Curtis offer us the images and articulate the words."—**MIGUEL POIARES MADURO**, Professor and Director of the Global Governance Programme, European University Institute, Villa La Pagliaiuola
- "Resnik and Curtis provide a stunning tour of the iconography and architecture of justice. Bristling with insights and steeped in learning, *Representing Justice* casts the relationship of democracy, justice, and law in an entirely new light. Both gripping narrative and deep meditation, there is no other book remotely like it."—NANCY FRASER, Henry A. & Louise Loeb Professor of Political and Social Science, New School for Social Research
- "This is an extraordinary book. It combines iconography of justice and claims about judges, courts, and democracy. With a deep sense of art and law, the reader is guided through the comparative history of judging, courts, and their role in society as manifested through the history of art and architecture. The book is a glorious proof that when judges sit at trial they stand on trial."—AHARON BARAK, Former Chief Justice of Israel

## Yale UNIVERSITY PRESS

New Haven & London yalebooks.com www.yalebooks.co.uk

